CAVTL Commission on Adult Vocational Teaching and Learning

One Year On Review

Frank McLoughlin CBE Principal, City and Islington College Chair, CAVTL

November 2014

CAVTL

Commission on Adult Vocational Teaching and Learning

Overview

After one of the most challenging economic periods for a generation we are now seeing signs of renewed optimism and stronger growth, with the UK forecast to grow faster than any other advanced economy.

But since the recession the UK has seen a large gap develop in its productivity compared to other leading economies. It is through the skills and capability of working people that businesses can turn this around. Yet, almost three-quarters of British businesses polled recently by The Prince's Trust and HSBC believe a significant skills crisis will hit the UK within the next three years. Nearly half predict it will happen within the next 12 months¹.

As business confidence strengthens and overall employment begins to rise, we must ensure that our skills system produces a talent pipeline of skilled individuals who can design, develop and deliver the sophisticated technology and high quality products and services, which will enable the UK to compete at the highest level. Strong advanced economies need high quality vocational education and training (VET) that can respond to and prepare us all for changes in work, advances in knowledge and technology, and the increasing demand for people with higher level skills.

It's about work... the 2013 report² of the Commission on Adult Vocational Teaching and Learning (CAVTL) was a report focused on the future. It assessed the role of vocational teaching and learning in supporting individuals, business and communities to grow and succeed – professionally, personally and socially. The OECD³ has highlighted the challenge for England - we have too little vocational provision at levels 4 and 5 in comparison with many other countries, and relative to potential demand.

1

¹ The Prince's Trust supported by HSBC (2014) *Skills Crunch: Upskilling the workforce of the future,* London: The Prince's Trust,

²The Commission on Adult Vocational Teaching and Learning (2013) *It's about work...Excellent adult vocational teaching and learning*, LSIS

³ http://www.oecd.org/

The CAVTL report articulated a vision of a first-class VET system, which

'develops the ability to perform in a job, and provides a platform for occupational, personal and educational progression. It must provide learners with both initial routes into work and through-career development, including opportunities to change career. It should be based on an ambition to expand vocational provision at levels 3, 4 and 5, as the basis for progression and economic growth.

Within such a VET system, vocational teaching and learning should be characterised by a **clear line of sight to work**, and underpinned by a **two-way street** – based on genuine collaboration between colleges and training providers, and employers.

This review, published one year on from the CAVTL report:

- A. reflects on progress in raising the status and quality of vocational education and training;
- B. recognises the significant contribution of the new Education and Training Foundation to the early implementation of the CAVTL recommendations;
- C. signposts four key developments that would further develop and strengthen the outcomes and impact of a first-class VET system.

Four signposts

The four developments signposted in section C are:

- 1. A new framework of recognised vocational **pathways to higher level vocational learning** within a re-configured progression system.
- A vision and proposition for the National VET Centre focused on providing a
 dynamic practice development and innovation hub to support the VET system

 employers, colleges and training providers.
- 3. Further consideration of the particular characteristics and features of prevocational (as opposed to vocational) programmes.
- 4. A **robust evaluation strategy** to measure progress towards the creation of a VET system, together with an **exemplar framework** for vocational teaching and learning, to ensure standards continue to rise.

A. Reflections

The Commission represented a once in a generation opportunity to raise the status of vocational teaching and learning, to promote its nature and heritage in its own terms, and to develop a robust vocational model. It did things differently. That meant open recruitment for commissioners; a non-Westminster based approach, focused on visiting and listening to learners, employers and practitioners; and working from practice to theory, mirroring how vocational teaching and learning practice often develops.

The leadership of the Commission – with vice chairs Fiona McMillan OBE, formerly president of the Association of Colleges and principal of Bridgwater College, and Graham Schuhmacher MBE, head of Development Services at Rolls-Royce – reflected a strong commitment to ensuring it was genuinely independent and driven by the sector in true partnership with employers – what we came to describe as the 'two-way street'. Our work was also informed and underpinned by a review of the research literature and practitioner evidence, and by the Commission's independent academic advisor, Professor Lorna Unwin.

Last summer, stewardship of the Commission's recommendations passed to the new Education and Training Foundation, owned by the education and training sector through the Association of Colleges (AoC), the Association of Employment and Learning Providers (AELP), and the Association of Adult Education and Training Organisations (AAETO), and funded by the Department for Business Innovation and Skills (BIS). In its first year of operation, the Foundation has held the centre of an emerging VET system, working with key partners including the UK Commission for Employment and Skills and Find a Future – the organisation that runs the UK Skills Show and skills competitions. A 'one-year on' review from the chair of CAVTL was requested by the Minister, as part of the Foundation's initial grant letter. It is an opportunity to reflect on progress and to offer signposts for the next phase of development, both for the Foundation, and for the VET system more widely.

Language

Even as the Commission met for the first time, it was clear that creating a common language – a vocational vernacular – would be a big prize. The public discourse around skills had been dominated for 20 years by discussion of funding, organisational structures and qualifications. Vocational teaching and learning were considered to be inside the 'black box'. To raise the status, esteem and value of vocational teaching and

learning, we needed to find a way to talk about it, in its own ambitious terms, rather than in relation to the old academic/vocational paradigm.

An important starting point was to reclaim the language of '**vocational education and training**' (VET), which had over time been replaced by 'learning and skills' or 'further education and skills'. We saw an opportunity to strengthen the connections with the international professional VET community, as a way of raising the esteem of vocational teaching and learning at home. We also recognised the potential to learn from international colleagues, to share our own practice more widely, and to maximise the export potential of our VET system.

The CAVTL phrase that has resonated most reflects the fundamental purpose of excellent vocational teaching and learning – it has a **clear line of sight to work.**Vocational learners must be able to see why they are learning what they are learning in connection to longer-term work goals. To understand that, while assignments will be assessed and exams passed, the ultimate goal is the ability to perform and succeed in the workplace. It also provided the title for the report – *It's about work...* It has been very pleasing to see and hear these phrases used by so many people - from teachers to leaders, employers to politicians – during the last year.

As well as enabling connections and continuity, language can also help to shift mind-sets and ultimately change behaviours. We very deliberately introduced the phrase a **two-way street** in recognition of the need to move on from past models of engagement between employers and providers. Historically the further education and training sector has tried to engage employers on its terms, or employers have tried to engage the sector on their terms, both looking at the problem from different ends of a one-way street. But the old supply and demand paradigm is not fit for the 21st century. We need a genuinely collaborative approach which is based on a shared understanding of the problems to be solved, the potential solutions and the business benefits of working together, for both employers and colleges or training providers. This approach focuses on how both ends of the street – working within a robust and well organised VET system – can help individuals and organisations to grow and succeed.

It isn't easy. It requires changing and building relationships not structures, joint responsibility not just vertical accountability, with implications for government and its agencies as well as employers, colleges and providers. But the use of the phrase a **two-way street** has helped to open up opportunities for discussion, and that has been good to see.

CAVTL characteristics

At the heart of the Commission's conclusions was a set of four characteristics which provided a lens through which to view excellent vocational teaching and learning:

- 1. A **clear line of sight to work** on all vocational programmes.
- 2. 'Dual professional' teachers and trainers who combine occupational and pedagogical expertise, and are trusted and given the time to develop partnerships and curricula with employers.
- 3. **Access to industry-standard facilities and resources** reflecting the ways in which technology is transforming work.
- 4. Clear **escalators to higher level vocational learning**, developing and combining deep knowledge and skills.

It was the Commission's view that if these characteristics were missing or weak, provision would not be vocational, let alone good.

Ofsted were supportive of the Commission during its work, and responded very positively to the proposal that the CAVTL characteristics of vocational teaching and learning offered an additional lens through which to review vocational provision. Through Matthew Coffey's leadership, Ofsted worked with the Education and Training Foundation's VET team to invite, select, visit and write up ten **CAVTL/Ofsted case studies** of good vocational teaching and learning practice which were published in January this year. There have been over 5,400 views of the case studies, and anecdotally, I know that managers and teachers have found the case studies a useful source of reference on exemplar provision. One delegate who attended a case study spotlight session commented that it 'clearly showed how powerful the impact is for learners when there are strong links with industry.4.

The Commission appreciated the Coalition Government's intention to enable 'the sector itself to develop, guided by its own insights and experiences rather than by impersonal instructions from a remote bureaucracy'⁵. We wanted to encourage teachers, trainers and leaders across the VET system to test the CAVTL conclusions against their own

⁴ Exeter College – Learning from the Best: Excellence in Hospitality and Catering

⁵ Department for Business, Innovation and Skills (2011) *New Challenges, New Chances: Further Education Skills System Reform Plan*, London: BIS

practice and arrangements, in ways that **enabled their energy, confidence and ambition to flourish.**

Over 60 colleges and providers are already engaged as formal active partners in the Education and Training Foundation's programmes focused on implementing CAVTL (see section 2). There are also groups of institutions around the country that have taken the initiative to review their own arrangements for vocational provision, using the CAVTL characteristics of excellent vocational teaching and learning as a tool or framework. This has been particularly pleasing because it demonstrates how the characteristics have resonated with the ambitions and current good practice of the sector. We will continue to learn from this important legacy of the Commission.

Another of the CAVTL recommendations was to encourage the **government's collaborative approach** to accountability to support the creation of the VET system. Key references to the CAVTL report in policy documents⁶ over the last year have continued to provide support for the implementation of the report's recommendations. In addition to the clear expectation within the Education and Training Foundation's grant letter that it would take forward the CAVTL recommendations, it has been good to see the reinforcement of this message in BIS's Skills Funding Statement, the Government's FE Workforce Strategy, and the emerging papers on higher level vocational education and national colleges, which have drawn on the CAVTL conclusions.

⁶ For example:

<u>Department for Education & Department for Business, Innovation and Skills (2013) *Rigour and Responsiveness in Skills*, London: BIS</u>

<u>Department for Business, Innovation and Skills & The Skills Funding Agency (2013)</u> *Skills Funding Statement* <u>2013-2016, London: BIS</u>

The Department for Business, Innovation and Skills (2014) Further Education Workforce Strategy: The Government's Strategy to Support Workforce Excellence in Further Education, London: BIS

The Department for Business, Innovation and Skills (2014) National Colleges - a call for engagement, London: BIS

B: Education and Training Foundation progress

The Education and Training Foundation was given responsibility for taking forward the recommendations from CAVTL as it was established in August 2013. Vocational education and training was added as a strategic priority to those previously identified: professional standards and workforce development; leadership, management and governance; and research and innovation.

Good progress has been made in the first 12 months. In particular, there has been significant investment (over £5 million contracted) in programmes that focus specifically on further improving the quality of vocational teaching and learning (CAVTL recommendations 3, 4, 6, 7, 8 and 9)⁷. Over 60 colleges and training providers are being supported directly to explore how their vocational practice and arrangements compare with the CAVTL characteristics of excellent vocational teaching and learning. Many more are involved in networks, partnerships and wider communities of practice.

The more challenging agenda set out by the CAVTL report – the creation of a sustainable 'VET system' based on the 'two-way street' – has, rightly, been identified as a longer term priority by the Foundation, and one which will require a strong partnership approach – in particular between colleges and training providers, and employers. Implementation of the two-way street is at an early stage. It will not be firmly established without concerted action by BIS, the Foundation and the UK Commission to bring employers to the table. Colleges and providers have to build on their well-established links with employers, as well as reaching out to new employers – and there is increasing evidence that this is happening; and employers have to reach out too. Genuine collaboration should be encouraged and supported, not imposed, on either side. At this early stage, it requires on-going facilitation by BIS and the Foundation to avoid colleges, providers and employers reverting to previous polarities, and to help build new partnership arrangements.

Highlights

Key highlights⁸ during the Foundation's first 12 months have been:

• Publication of 16 models of **Teach Too** practice, over 6,200 views of the Teach Too website since June, and investment in a suite of development and innovation

⁷ See Annex 2 for the list of CAVTL recommendations

⁸ See Annex 3 for a full review of progress against the CAVTL recommendations

projects for colleges and providers, leading to principles for a national framework for Teach Too this autumn. **Teach Too** involves **industry experts teaching their work**, reflecting the CAVTL finding that the best vocational teaching and learning combines occupational and pedagogical expertise.

- Publication and dissemination of a suite of ten CAVTL/Ofsted case studies, providing exemplars of good vocational teaching and learning practice, published by Ofsted.
- The first National VET Conference at the Skills Show, November 2013. The
 conference provided a focus for the creation of a movement to harness the
 ambition of employers, providers and learners for higher level skills, developed
 through a strong VET system.
- An **event for over 30 major employers**, in partnership with the UK Commission and Find a Future at the Science Museum in July 2014. The event marked the start of a dialogue with leading employers about practical steps they and others in their networks could take to support the UK skills system.
- Establishment of a **VET Expert Panel** to advise the Foundation on priorities for VET, including the implementation of the CAVTL report.
- A programme of professional development to embed and extend skills
 competitions practice, which is contributing to the process of deepening
 vocational expertise which the Commission recognised as key to the continuous
 raising of standards, leading to improved efficiency and effectiveness at work.
 Bringing public funding for competitions and the Skills Show within the grant to
 the Foundation provides further potential for reinforcing excellence in VET more
 widely across the sector.
- Development programmes supporting vocational teachers, trainers and assessors involved in **traineeships** and **apprenticeships** based on the CAVTL characteristics of excellent vocational teaching and learning.
- In support of commitments made by the Further Education Learning Technology Action Group (FELTAG), introduction of a development programme to support the education and training workforce to harness the potential of **learning technologies and digital pedagogies**. This programme supports the CAVTL technology recommendation about the importance of vocational learners, teachers and trainers keeping up to date with the ways in which technology is transforming work. It has been particularly good to see significant employer involvement and support for this programme⁹.
- Working with BIS, the Department for Education, the AoC and AELP, to communicate and offer a wider range of incentives under the FE workforce

_

⁹ visit http://www.et-foundation.co.uk/guest/inspiring-learning-technology/

strategy and specifically those aimed at raising the quality of maths teaching in further education and training. This includes creation of a **maths teacher recruitment incentive scheme**, which is contributing to the achievement of the CAVTL recommendation to develop a **cadre of specialist maths and English tutors** with the specialist pedagogies required to support young people and adults and to support vocational teachers and trainers within a locality.

• CAVTL commissioner, Dereth Wood, chaired the review of **professional standards** advisory group, helping to secure a commitment to the following as part of the new standards for professional teachers and trainers: 'Maintain and update your teaching and training expertise and vocational skills through collaboration with employers'.

Looking ahead

Plans are in place to address other elements of the CAVTL recommendations over the next 12 months, including:

- A programme to support leadership of VET, based on the Commission's
 finding that the best leaders of VET demonstrates an 'external disposition' –
 facing outwards from their own organisations to develop productive strategic
 partnerships to ensure vocational programmes meet employers' skills needs, now
 and in the future. This will include the development of industrial placement
 opportunities for the most senior leaders.
- Building on the Teach Too national framework to extend Teach Too practice within the VET system, including additional investment from BIS for an extension to Teach Too to incentivise employers to release staff with maths expertise to support maths teaching in vocational contexts, and a STEM-focused component, building on the Perkins Review of Engineering Skills¹⁰.
- The second **national VET conference** in November 2014, which will focus on building technical and professional skills for the future.

It is vital that the Foundation puts in place a robust evaluation strategy to measure the impact of, and build on the learning from, its initial programmes over the course of next year, with a view to developing:

• an exemplar framework to benchmark and share examples of excellent vocational teaching and learning;

¹⁰ Perkins J (2013) Professor John Perkins' Review of Engineering Skills, London: BIS

- a vocational teaching and learning professional development enhancement programme, based on evidence of effective practice;
- a set of measures to enable a systematic measurement of impact, on the development of the VET system overall;
- an annual review of progress and forward plan for consideration at the national VET conference to maintain momentum and support the ambition to create a VET system with employers at the heart.

C: Four signposts for the future

The creation of a first-class VET system is a long term project, needing sustained action by all parties. In particular, it will require employers large and small, colleges and training providers to raise their ambitions for their own workforce development strategies. We have got out of the habit of developing talent 'in-house'. But the stark prediction of skills shortages as the economy continues to growth makes this a business critical issue.

There is much for employers, colleges and training providers to learn from each other, and to share with others across the VET system, about how to do this well, in order to re-focus on the business need for workforce development – for both initial and continuing formation of occupational expertise. A particular area of concern for the Commission was the need to improve arrangements to support small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) to enable them to deliver apprenticeships and meet their wider workforce development needs. The skill formation and productivity potential of SMEs is under-developed in England. CAVTL was impressed with the way some larger employers were actively encouraging and supporting SMEs in their supply chains to engage with VET.

The Commission also noted the support that colleges and training providers could offer to SMEs to support the development of new products, processes and markets. Small businesses often lack the research and development departments of larger firms. As such, college/provider involvement would also be a way of keeping staff up to date with the current industrial and commercial context, and this would be another example of the two-way street.

Looking back on progress since the CAVTL report was published, is also an opportunity look ahead. In conclusion, I offer four signposts for the future:

- 1. Develop a new framework of recognised vocational **pathways to higher level vocational learning** within a re-configured progression system.
- 2. Develop the vision and proposition for the **National VET Centre** focused on providing a **dynamic practice development and innovation hub** to support the VET system employers, colleges and training providers.
- 3. Give further consideration to the particular characteristics and features of prevocational (as opposed to vocational) programmes.

4. Establish a **robust evaluation strategy** to measure progress towards the creation of a VET system, and develop an **exemplar framework** for vocational teaching and learning, to ensure standards continue to rise.

1. Higher level vocational education and training – the secret garden

The Coalition Government has taken significant steps to promote vocational education and training, in particular apprenticeships, in the last four years. Looking ahead to next year and the next parliament, it is **higher level vocational education and training** (level 4 and above), designed to develop the **technician workforce of the future** that must be the priority. On the principle, it seems, there is widespread agreement. More challenging will be the task of maintaining the momentum of early developments, particularly over the next 12-24 months.

Higher level vocational provision – the technical training route to and within work - has become obscured in the last 20 years. As Alison Fuller and Lorna Unwin have illustrated, in the past many technicians would have progressed to the higher level via work-based training programmes, but 'a move to graduate-level entry aligned with professional registration requirements, has disrupted this route and consequently intermediate-level provision (HNC) has faded¹¹. The pathway may be overgrown, but it is still there - a bit like a secret garden. We need to reveal, maintain and encourage it to blossom and flourish once more.

There are compelling economic and social reasons for developing a new framework of recognised vocational pathways within a re-configured progression system that has 'clear escalators to higher level vocational learning'. A strong and well-articulated vocational ladder will not only open up routes to higher level vocational programmes, it will also strengthen the quality of provision at level 3 and at level 2, thereby reinforcing the platform on which to expand higher level VET, and creating a strong skills pipeline for employers and individuals.

In order for higher-level vocational teaching and learning to flourish, however, clarity is needed about the framework of vocational qualifications at levels 4 and above. The design and delivery of those qualifications (as with all vocational qualifications including apprenticeship standards) should be based on two of the founding principles of the CAVTL report. They should:

¹¹ Fuller A, Unwin L (2014) Expanding Intermediate Level Vocational Education: The Need for a Holistic Approach in AoC Higher Vocational Education: A Collection of Think Pieces, London: Association of Colleges

- be co-designed and co-delivered by employers and providers (the 'two-way street') to capitalise on the industry expertise of employers, as well as the curriculum, pedagogical and assessment expertise and experience of advanced teachers and trainers;
- include both a **national core and locally tailored element** to secure their export potential as part of a robust national system of qualifications and quality assurance, as well as their relevance and responsiveness to local economic needs.

Within a framework of qualifications designed on these principles, a focus on curriculum development and programme design would enable the growth of **excellent higher level vocational teaching and learning**. CAVTL found that there were four key pedagogical components to excellent vocational teaching and learning:

- the development of **knowledge**;
- combined with the development of skills/practice;
- with opportunities for practical problem solving and critical reflection on experience;
- within a **community of practice** that supports the **development of professional identity.**

These components should be at the heart of all higher level vocational programmes. This should be the case whether the programme is work-based, or organised on the basis of full-time study. Critically, employers must be centrally involved in full-time vocational provision, as well as in the work-based route.

To maintain momentum over the next 2 years, the following steps are proposed:

1. The **framework of level 4 and above vocational pathways and qualifications needs clarity**, in particular at levels 4 and 5, building on the Adult Vocational Qualifications Review¹². The future of, and relationship between HNDs and HNCs, Foundation Degrees, and higher apprenticeships needs to be clear and understood.¹³ There should be both work-based and study-based routes to developing higher level vocational and technical expertise.

¹² Whitehead N (2013) Review of Adult Vocational Qualifications In England, London: UKCES

¹³ See Annex 1 for a summary of the current English qualifications frameworks

- 2. Higher level vocational **qualifications should be co-designed and delivered** by employers and colleges or training providers based on the principle of the two-way street either in partnership with a university, or with their own awarding powers, and with professional bodies to build links to their professional registration requirements.
- 3. A strong focus for colleges, training providers and employers should be on designing, developing and showcasing innovative vocational curriculum programmes and pedagogies, including making effective use of industry-standard technologies to support excellent higher level vocational teaching and learning. We need education and training organisations to become focal points of a mature, world-class VET system delivering advanced technical and vocational programmes, with smaller as well as larger employers.¹⁴
- 4. The development of a National VET Centre to provide a dynamic practice development and innovation hub to support consortia of colleges, providers and employers working together within a VET system, including the new national colleges, to secure a pipeline of technician talent to build and sustain our future prosperity. Such a model could act as a new international exemplar for a world-class VET system.

2. National Vocational Education and Training Centre – the longer term ambition

The recommendation to establish a National VET Centre to take responsibility for research and development of VET represented the longer-term ambition of the Commission. It spoke to a recognition of the need for a dynamic focus for raising the esteem and quality of vocational teaching and learning, inextricably linked to raising standards and productivity at work. At its heart is a vision of a hub for a new, practice to theory, approach to research, development and innovation. In other words, a centre that would theorise from examples of effective practice so that they could be applied in other contexts, and using problems that have arisen in the workplace to set the research agenda. This is often how progress has occurred in industry and with regard to crafts of various kinds. It equally applies to teaching.

¹⁴ This could be along the lines suggested by the Association of Colleges in <u>Association of Colleges</u> (2014) <u>Breaking the Mould</u>, <u>London: AoC</u>

Understandably, the Education and Training Foundation placed its engagement in the development of such a centre on a longer term, strategic track during its first year of operation. The time is now right to further develop the vision and proposition for the VET Centre, given:

- the focus on creating a network of colleges and providers to develop higher level skills which would benefit from a dynamic hub of support;
- the community of practice around vocational teaching, learning and leadership that informed, and has built on the CAVTL findings, including through engagement with the Foundation's VET programmes;
- the investment that BIS has announced in an academic-led VET Research Centre¹⁵ which would be highly complementary to the Commission's early vision.

Working from practice to theory, the VET Centre would work dynamically with the BIS Research Centre, with its focus on the economics of vocational education and rigorous analysis of the official administrative and existing large statistical data sets. The CAVTL VET Centre should make a significant contribution to:

- supporting the **development and sharing** of effective vocational teaching, learning and leadership practice;
- strengthening the VET system by building genuinely collaborative
 arrangements between employers, and education and training providers;
- providing a focus for ambition to continue to raise standards in VET and work to support our future prosperity; and
- **shaping the experimentation and trials** proposed by the BIS VET Research Centre proposals.

3. Pre-vocational teaching and learning

A key conclusion from CAVTL was that the best vocational teaching and learning develops learners' occupational expertise. This is best achieved in provision that is in work, or has a clear line of sight to work, and entails the development of **occupational skills, knowledge and capabilities** so that learners are equipped to move from that status to worker as swiftly as possible. This does not mean that learners fail to develop key/core skills of employability; they simply do so in occupationally-specific contexts.

 $^{^{15}}$ The Department for Business Innovation and Skills (BIS) has launched a tender to develop the Vocational Education Research Centre with funding of approximately £1 million a year for 3 years with the possible extension to 5 years. BIS aim to announce the award of the contract in February/March 2015.

A strong vocational teaching and learning system supports pre-vocational provision. The Commission acknowledged the connection between **pre-vocational** and vocational programmes but believed that the former **demands a particular set of considerations about design and content** which are different from those related to vocational provision.

There continues to be understandable concern about youth unemployment. Alongside the move to raise the participation age, it has provided a focus for a great deal of work to consider the role that vocational education should be playing in a landscape where young people are going to be required to participate to age 18, including the development of traineeships.

I recommend that **further consideration be given to the characteristics and features of pre-vocational programmes**. Some of these might be study programmes for young people, including traineeships, and some elements of the Work Programme for adults. Connecting these programmes to the ways in which work is changing is critical, but it is not the case that the CAVTL characteristics apply equally to pre-vocational programmes. For example, the teaching expertise that teachers and trainers need to work effectively with students on pre-vocational programmes may be different from the 'dual professional' expertise that is one of the hallmarks of excellent vocational provision.

Strengthening vocational teaching and learning will support pre-vocational provision too, giving it a clearer sense of purpose, linked to a line of sight to work. But that should involve employers being engaged in a wider range of ways that go beyond work experience. Effective strategies for building employer engagement into pre-vocational teaching and learning would be worthy of further investigation.

4. Sustaining progress, raising standards

This will be my final CAVTL report, but it should not signal the end of the Commission's legacy. Sustaining the movement to raise the quality, esteem and ambition of our VET system remains central to the task of re-building a strong, advanced economy for the first half of the 21st century. It is a shared endeavour. The Education and Training Foundation has recognised this, and I would encourage it to continue to develop its strategic partnerships to harness the commitment from employers, education and training providers and government to realise the vision of a first-class VET system.

In particular, I would encourage the Foundation, with the UK Commission for Employment and Skills to:

- develop an exemplar framework to benchmark and share examples of excellent vocational teaching and learning;
- utilise a set of measures to enable a systematic measurement of impact, on the development of the VET system overall an initial set is proposed below; and
- review progress and forward plan annually, using the established drum beat of the national VET conference to maintain momentum and support the ambition to create a VET system with employers at the heart.

Possible progress measures for a VET system

Overall impact:

- An increase in the range and volume of vocational provision which demonstrates the four characteristics of excellent vocational teaching and learning identified by CAVTL, and which is graded good or outstanding by Ofsted.
- A strong VET system, which increases the volume, quality and impact of vocational education and training at levels 3 to 5.
- Enhanced reputation of the further education and training sector in the eyes of employers large and small, as they see themselves as part of one VET system, not in a supplier/consumer relationship.
- More employers engaged in, and investing in, the VET system.

Other measures:

- The development of a specialist cadre of maths teachers in localities to support vocational teachers and trainers.
- The development of 'dual professional' vocational teachers and trainers who combine occupational and pedagogical expertise.
- The development of leaders with an 'external disposition' to build the two-way street.
- Increasing access to, and effective use of, industry-standard technology in vocational education and training.

Macro-measures of outcomes for learners and employers:

- Improving destination outcomes for learners from vocational programmes.
- Positive impact on earnings for learners with level 3+ qualifications.

Annexes

Annex 1: English qualifications frameworks¹⁶

| Level | Qualifications and Credit Framework / National Qualifications Framework for England | Framework for Higher Education in England, Wales and Northern Ireland |
|-------|---|--|
| 8 | Vocational Qualifications Level 8 | Doctoral Degrees |
| 7 | Fellowships NVQ Level 5 Vocational Qualifications Level 7 | Masters Degrees Integrated Masters Degrees Postgraduate Diplomas Postgraduate Certificate in Education Postgraduate Certificates |
| 6 | Vocational Qualifications Level 6 | Bachelors Degrees Professional Graduate Certificate in Education Graduate Diplomas Graduate Certificates |
| 5 | NVQ Level 5 Higher National Diplomas (HND) Vocational Qualifications Level 5 | Foundation Degrees Diplomas of Higher Education (DipHE) Higher National Diplomas (HND) |
| 4 | NVQ Level 4 Vocational Qualifications Level 4 Higher National Certificates (HNC) | Higher National Certificates (HNC) Certificates of Higher Education (CertHE) |
| 3 | NVQ Level 3 National Qualifications Level 3 GCSE AS and A Level Advanced Diplomas Access to HE Diplomas | |
| 2 | NVQ Level 2 Vocational Qualifications Level 2 GCSEs at grade A-C ESOL skills for life Higher Diplomas Functional skills level 2 | |
| 1 | NVQ Level 1 Vocational Qualifications Level 1 GCSEs at grade D-G ESOL skills for life Foundation Diplomas Functional Skills Level 1 | |
| Entry | Entry level certificate Functional skills Entry Level | |

¹⁶ Source: McCosham A, Hillage J (2013) *OECD Review, Skills Beyond School Background Report for England:* <u>UKCES Briefing Paper, London: UKCES</u>

Annex 2: CAVTL Ten Recommendations

It's about work...

Excellent adult vocational teaching and learning

1. Adopt the two-way street

Adopt the concept of a VET system working as a **two-way street**, not further education and skills operating as a separate 'sector'. The **two-way street** is about genuine collaboration between college and training providers, and employers.

Test the spectrum of ways the **two-way street** can operate in practice – VET partners to review their current practice and include systematic plans to adopt the concept of a VET system working as a **two-way street** within their future arrangements.

Who should take this forward? This is a recommendation for everyone – individual colleges and training providers, the new Guild, employers, trade unions supporting workforce development, the UK Commission for Employment and Skills through its work on stimulating demand, and government by supporting other recommendations such as **Teach Too**.

2. Develop a core and tailored approach to vocational qualifications

Consider the development of a **core and tailored approach** to enable vocational qualifications to meet the shared aims of employers and individual learners. There should be a nationally specified core and a tailored element to meet local demand.

Who should take this forward? We ask that the Adult Vocational Qualifications for England review considers this recommendation as part of its work.

3. Revise the education and training arrangements for VET teachers and trainers including introducing Teach Too

Revise and strengthen the education and training arrangements for VET teachers and trainers – from initial teacher training through to continuing professional development, to develop 'dual professionals' – with a new priority on professional updating.

With specific reference to the **Teach Too** scheme, establish a feasibility study and pilots to explore the potential to encourage occupational experts from industry to become involved in vocational teaching and learning.

Who should take this forward? A role for the new Guild, working with teacher educators in HE and employers in taking forward **Teach Too**, as part of its overall proposed remit to define, develop and enhance the professionalism of the FE and skills sector workforce and its providers.

Leaders and managers should have a lead role in supporting the development of vocational teachers and trainers with a particular emphasis on ensuring that occupational expertise is the leading characteristic for recruitment, continuing professional development and reward.

For teacher educators in HE, a role to review their programmes against the characteristics and distinctive features of adult vocational teaching and learning.

4. Reinstate employers' presence and influence across VET providers starting with curricula panels

This is very much about the **two-way street** and ensuring a **clear line of sight to work**, for example ensuring that every curriculum area in a college or a training provider should have at least one employer sponsor, and preferably an employer panel involving trade unions.

Who should take this forward? This will involve individual VET providers, employers and trade unions working together.

5. Establish a National VET Centre to take responsibility for research and development of VET

Establish a National VET Centre that includes a new research and development capacity focused on vocational pedagogy and the development of VET more widely. The VET Centre would also take responsibility for the development of a regional 'Network of Centres' to showcase and experiment with new ideas for excellent vocational teaching and learning, and to act as focal points for employers and other partners to evaluate its impact.

Who should take this forward? This will require a shared commitment from colleges and training providers, cutting-edge employers, the new Guild, and the government to work with leading research experts, universities, and international partners to find the most appropriate way forward.

6. Test the key characteristics and distinctive features of adult vocational teaching and learning

VET partners to collaborate to review their current practice and arrangements against those described in the Commission's report and include systematic plans for further improvement within their self-assessment processes.

Who should take this forward? VET partners working with the new Guild and the VET Centre, and with the support of Ofsted to determine how best to evaluate the improvements brought about by this approach.

7. Develop the role of technology in VET

Further support the continuing professional development of vocational teachers and trainers in order to build their pedagogical knowledge of the optimal use of learning technologies, in collaboration with the London Knowledge Lab at the Institute of Education.

Explore the feasibility of national investment in, and co-ordination of digital simulation (or haptics) resources and software to maximise the potential for UK-wide VET gain, but also as a potential export.

Who should take this forward? This is a recommendation primarily for colleges, training providers and government. Support for vocational teachers and trainers to build their pedagogical knowledge of the optimal use of learning technologies will sit with the Guild and the VET Centre, working with the London Knowledge Lab. The exploration of the feasibility of national investment in, and co-ordination of, the development of digital simulations to support vocational teaching and learning requires government support.

8. Create a cadre of specialist English and maths tutors in every college

An intensive programme of training must be funded and organised to develop specialist tutors with the specialist pedagogies required to support young people and adults and to support vocational teachers and trainers. Each cadre would then be available as a resource shared between all vocational education and training providers within a specified locality.

Who should take this forward? A role for government, the new Guild, teacher educators in HE, working with VET partners.

9. Strengthen the leadership and management of VET

Support the development of VET leaders and managers to enable them to both lead the process of improvement of vocational teaching and learning, and build the **two-way street**.

Who should take this forward? Colleges and training providers with support from the Guild and the work of the VET Centre.

10. Encourage the collaborative role of government and explore the use of effective incentives to drive demand and the engagement of employers

Encourage government and its agencies to continue the more collaborative approach to accountability introduced in *New Challenges, New Chances*. In particular to:

- consider how government can use the levers it has available to drive employer demand and engagement, including investigate how public funding for vocational

teaching and learning can be made dependent on (a) employers acting as sponsors for vocational learning programmes; and (b) colleges and providers demonstrating a clear line of sight to work on their vocational programmes;

- support VET partners to develop stronger arrangements for evaluating the impact of vocational teaching and learning for employers, individuals and community partners;
- review the role of intermediaries and where they add value or create barriers;
- ask Ofsted to consider the distinctive features of vocational teaching and learning identified in our report as an additional lens through which to review vocational provision;
- encourage Ofsted to consider giving VET partners a role within future inspection frameworks, in order to support Ofsted inspectors to develop their understanding of the distinctive features of vocational pedagogy.

Who should take this forward? Government and its agencies, working collaboratively with all VET partners.

Annex 3: Education and Training Foundation progress against the 10 CAVTL recommendations

This annex sets out the progress made by the Foundation between August 2013 and October 2014 in addressing the ten CAVTL recommendations. It also identifies priorities for the future.

| CAVTL recommendation | Foundation progress August 2013 – October 2014 | Future plans | | |
|--|--|---|--|--|
| 1. Adopt the concept of a VET system working as a two-way street, not further education and skills operating as a separate 'sector'. Test the spectrum of ways the two-way street can operate in practice – VET partners to review their current practice and include systematic plans to adopt the two-way street within their future arrangements. | National VET conference in November 2013, in partnership with UKCES, hosted by The Skills Show. The aim of the conference was to start a movement to harness the ambition of employers, providers and learners for higher level skills, developed through a strong VET system. 260 delegates attended the conference. Inclusion of 3 employers within the Foundation's VET expert panel framework. At its early meetings the panel has considered: how the CAVTL characteristics of excellent vocational teaching and learning should be embedded in the Foundation's work; early proposals for the principles for a Teach Too national framework; and progress with the Foundation's learning technologies programme.¹⁷ | A two-way street programme in partnership with UKCES, to: pilot 'local leadership exchanges' between employers and providers wishing to move from transactional to transformational relationships. develop a range of strategic dialogues in key industry sectors with a range of VET partners. support colleges and training providers to maximise their use of labour market intelligence to ensure a responsive curriculum offer. Development of the Foundation's employer engagement strategy, building on the summer reception and in addition to develop ways of working with employer representative bodies and local enterprise partnerships. | | |

 $^{^{17}\,\}underline{http://et\text{-}foundation.co.uk/wp\text{-}content/uploads/2014/04/Membership\text{-}of\text{-}the\text{-}Expert\text{-}Panels\text{-}apr\text{-}update.pdf}$

- Examples of two-way street practice captured within the ten CAVTL/Ofsted case studies.¹⁸
- Summer 2014 reception for 30 major employers at the Science Museum, in partnership with the UK Commission for Employment and Skills and Find a Future¹⁹.
- Phase one of both the traineeship and apprenticeship Staff Support Programmes²⁰ (TSSP and ASSP), delivered by AELP and partners have focused on developing CPD materials to support colleges and providers to engage with employers to enable the effective delivery of on-the-job training and work experience elements of apprenticeship and traineeship programmes.
- Both programmes, and the Learning Futures programme, delivered by Gazelle and partners, are benefitting from employer involvement on their steering groups. The Spirit Pub Company is a member of the TSSP steering group; Coventry and Warwickshire Chamber of Commerce sits on the ASSP steering group. Microsoft, Google, Intel, JLab, Clearswift and Risual sit on the Learning Futures steering group

- Engagement with STEM employers, including SMEs, to provide employer secondment and work placement opportunities for tutors and trainers to improve the delivery of work-related STEM programmes.
- The second national VET conference at the Skills Show in November 2014. The theme of this conference is 'Building Technical and Professional Skills'

¹⁸ http://www.ofsted.gov.uk/resources/good-practice-case-studies-for-vocational-education-and-training

¹⁹ http://www.et-foundation.co.uk/news/respond-one-biggest-challenges-facing-national-productivity-skills-workforce/

²⁰ http://www.traineeship-staff-support.co.uk/ and http://www.apprenticeship-staff-support.co.uk/

| | | • | Five of the Foundation's practitioner research projects in 2014 are focused on 'employers and employability' as a direct response to the findings of the CAVTL report. ²¹ | | |
|----|--|---|--|---|---|
| 2. | Consider the development of core and tailored approach to enable vocational qualifications to meet the shared aims of employers and learners. There should be a nationally specified core and a tailored element to meet local demand. CAVTL asked that the Adult Vocational Qualifications Review for England take this forward. | • | The apprenticeship reform proposals are leading to new expressions of the standards for each occupation / apprenticeship. This has implications for the detailed curriculum planning needed to underpin the standards, as well as the development of progression pathways to higher level vocational programmes. This is one of the key themes being addressed in the Foundation's apprenticeship staff support programme. | • | Phase 2 of the apprenticeship Staff Support Programme will focus on building curriculum development and teaching and learning capacity within the sector, as well as helping the sector to understand and accommodate the emerging work and findings of the Trailblazers. |
| 3. | Revise and strengthen the education and training arrangements for VET teachers and trainers to develop 'dual professionals' with a new priority on professional updating. With specific reference to Teach Too, establish a feasibility study and pilots to explore the potential to encourage occupational experts from industry to become involved in vocational teaching and learning. | • | A programme to develop a Teach Too national framework is in place, led by the Institute of Education with AELP. 16 demonstration models of current Teach Too practice were published in June. There have been 6,240 visits to the Teach Too website since June. The Demonstration Models and a suite of innovation projects have informed the development of principles for a national framework which will be published in December 2014. ²² | • | An extension to the Teach Too programme will incentivise people from industry to get involved in supporting maths teaching and learning within vocational programmes. There will also be a focus on how Teach Too can support STEM programmes, a service-based occupational area and the development of new skills with an emerging sector. |

²¹ The Education and Training Foundation (2014) Practitioner-led Action Research
²² http://teachtoo.org/

| A CPD programme to embed and extend skills competitions practice is underway, delivered by the Association of Colleges through the WorldSkills Portfolio Group of partners²³. This programme is extending the effective teaching and learning practices used to support skills competitors to a wider range of vocational teachers and trainers. This will contribute to the process of deepening vocational expertise which the Commission recognised is key to the continuous raising of standards leading to improved efficiency and effectiveness at work. 500 practitioners have been involved in the first wave of 18 CPD sessions. Further sessions are taking place this autumn. CAVTL commissioner, Dereth Wood who is Director of Learning, Strategy and Policy at learndirect, has chaired the review of professional standards advisory group, making the link between this CAVTL recommendation and the Foundation's review of professional standards for teachers and trainers, in particular the commitment to 'maintain and update your teaching and training expertise and vocational skills through collaboration with employers'. | The Foundation will explore opportunities to facilitate occupational updating as part of the new professional membership service currently being developed. |
|--|---|
| The Teach Too development projects have supported 16 partnerships between | The extension to the Teach Too programme will explicitly promote the |

²³ http://www.aoc.co.uk/about-colleges/world-skills-uk-the-skills-show/national-skills-competition-cpd-programme

| Reinstate employers' presence and influence across VET providers starting with curricula panels. | employers and colleges/training providers to explore ways to reinstate employers' presence and influence in the VET curriculum. The 'two-way street' development programme is also taking this recommendation as a focus. Some feedback from colleges has highlighted that curricula panels are just one way to secure employers' influence. In some cases, college or training provider representatives might join employer groups to achieve this end – in another version of the 'two-way street'. | engagement of employers in curriculum design, development and delivery. The Foundation's employer engagement strategy will be designed to support this recommendation. The Foundation's planned exemplar framework for vocational teaching and learning will highlight the different ways in which employers and colleges/training providers are co-designing and codelivering vocational programmes. |
|--|---|---|
| Establish a National VET Centre to take responsibility for research and development of VET. | A range of early discussions about the potential of and scope for a VET Centre were held with stakeholders during autumn 2013 – particularly the VET Centre roundtable event at the Skills Show and the Foundation's seminar at the AoC conference. The Foundation's operational plan 2014-16 shifted the focus in the short term towards the Foundation's role in supporting the creation of a VET system with employers at its heart. The Foundation is also closely involved in the development of the BIS Vocational Education Research Centre. | The Foundation will build on the communities of practice established around its VET programmes to continue to support a dynamic, reflexive research and development approach to supporting innovative vocational education and training leadership and practice. |

- 6. Employers and providers to review the key characteristics and distinctive features of vocational teaching and learning against their own practice and include systematic plans for further improvement within their self-assessment plans.
- The CAVTL characteristics and features of excellent teaching and learning are included as key principles in each of the Foundation's invitations to tender for VET programmes.
- Over 60 colleges and providers are already directly involved (with many more engaged through networks and partnerships) in the Foundation's VET CPD programmes.
- The characteristics and distinctive features form an important part of the Foundation's quality assurance and evaluation framework for its VET programmes and strategy.
- Anecdotally, it is pleasing to hear that:
 - Colleges in London are using the characteristics and features to review their own provision;
 - they have also been used by AELP in quality improvement/CPD sessions with independent training providers;
 - the Institute of Education is using the CAVTL/Ofsted case studies (based around the characteristics) as learning resources on their initial teacher education programme.

 The Foundation will be commissioning a synthesis evaluation of its VET programmes, within the framework of the CAVTL characteristics and distinctive features of excellent vocational teaching and learning, in order to inform the development of an exemplar framework and CPD enhancement programme in 2015.

- Support the CPD of vocational teachers and trainers to build their pedagogical knowledge of the optimal use of learning technologies.
 - Explore the feasibility of national investment in, and co-ordination of digital simulation resources and software to maximise the potential for UK-wide VET gain, but also as a potential export.
- established to build the capacity of the education and training workforce to harness the potential of learning technologies and digital pedagogies. This programme is supporting governors, leaders, managers, teachers, trainers, assessors and technical teams to invest in, plan for and utilise learning technologies effectively to improve outcomes for learners. This is a cross-Foundation programme, which incorporates a strong VET strand to respond to the CAVTL technology recommendation.²⁴
- This work also responds to the FELTAG report which itself has drawn on the conclusions of the CAVTL report and the supplementary papers commissioned from Diana Laurillard, at the London Knowledge Lab.
- The learning technologies strategic conversation commissioned by the Foundation earlier this year to inform its support programme has also drawn significantly on the CAVTL conclusions as part of its literature review.²⁵

 There is more to do to explore the feasibility of national investment in, and co-ordination of digital simulation resources and software to maximise the potential for UK-wide and export gain. The Foundation will look to work in partnership with key stakeholders (including the Ufi Charitable Trust) involved in technology to progress this recommendation.

²⁴ http://lfutures.co.uk/

²⁵ The Education and Training Foundation (April 2014) *Coralesce Strategic Consultation Report on Technology in Teaching and Learning*, Cranleigh, Surrey: Coralesce Ltd.

| | • | In addition, a learning technologies self- assessment tool is being developed and trialled by the education and training sector to assist colleges and providers and their staff to review their arrangements and strategies for learning technologies and to develop improvement plans. ²⁶ | | |
|---|---|--|---|--|
| Create a cadre of specialist English and maths tutors in each locality with the specialist pedagogies required to support young people and adults, and to support vocational teachers and trainers. | • | Working with BIS, AoC and AELP, the Foundation has established the maths teacher recruitment incentive scheme, which aims to facilitate the recruitment of maths graduates, or graduates with good maths skills, to train to teach in the education and training sector. An enhanced incentive fund of £30,000 has been made available to those providers who could demonstrate they are carrying out activity which contributes to the achievement of the CAVTL recommendation to develop a cadre of specialist tutors with the specialist pedagogies required to support young people and adults and to support vocational teachers and trainers within a locality. 34 providers are currently implementing their plans for this incentive funding. The impact of this initiative on the CAVTL recommendation will be evaluated as part of the overall evaluation of the Foundation's VET programmes. | • | The Foundation is considering how it can further support teachers and trainers to develop approaches to embedding maths and English within vocational programmes in its vocational teaching and learning programme due to be launched in 2014-15. This will be informed by specific analysis of workforce data currently underway. The impact of the incentive fund will be evaluated as part of Foundation's VET evaluation plan during 2014-15. |

²⁶ http://www.edtech-assess.com/

| | | • | A number of the Foundation's practitioner research projects in 2014 are focused on developing expertise in English and maths teaching ²⁷ . Two teachers from Barking and Dagenham College, from last year's practitioner research programme, have been shortlisted for the 2014 Best Research and Practice Project Award run by the European Association for Practitioner Research on Improving Learning this November. ²⁸ | | |
|----|---|---|---|---|---|
| 9. | Support the development of VET leaders and managers to enable them to both lead the process of improvement of vocational teaching and learning, and build the two-way street, through developing an external disposition. | • | A Leadership Summit, attended by 150 current and future leaders from across the sector in October 2014, was designed to understand the challenges faced by the sector and develop innovative and sustainable solutions. The Foundation ran a workshop which explored a two-way street exchange between Aylesbury College and McAfee Intel exploring the journey, barriers and success in the collaborative development of curricula that has a direct line of sight to work. This workshop served as an early practice for the leadership exchange programme. | • | This recommendation is being taken forward through the two-way street local leadership exchange programme (see 1 above). There is also scope to include the outcomes from this work as a module within the new leadership framework being developed by the Foundation. Building on the summer 2013 reception for employers, the Foundation's employer advisory group will have a focus on encouraging more business representation on sector governing bodies/boards. |
| 10 | . Encourage the collaborative role of government and explore the use of | • | The Foundation is currently developing its evaluation framework for VET which will reflect the findings, conclusions and | • | See also progress against recommendation 5 |

²⁷ http://practitionerledactionresearch2014.wordpress.com/multimodal-research-reports/research-reports/employers-and-employability/

²⁸ http://www.et-foundation.co.uk/news/barking-dagenham-cyprus/

effective incentives to drive demand and the engagement of employers:

- Consider how government can use the levers it has available to drive employer demand and engagement, including investigating how public funding for VET can be made dependent on (a) employers acting as sponsors for vocational programmes; and (b) colleges and providers demonstrating a clear line of sight to work on their vocational programmes;
- Support VET partners to develop stronger arrangements for evaluating the impact of vocational teaching and learning for employers, individuals and community partners;
- Review the role of intermediaries and where they add value or create barriers;
- Ask Ofsted to consider the distinctive features of vocational teaching and learning identified in the CAVTL report as an additional lens through which to review vocational provision.
- Encourage Ofsted to consider giving VET partners a role within future inspection frameworks, in order to support Ofsted inspectors to develop their understanding of the distinctive features of vocational pedagogy.

- recommendations from the CAVTL report. We will implement this framework with our delivery partners and the colleges/providers with whom we are working.
- Ten CAVTL/Ofsted case studies of good vocational teaching and learning practice were published on the Ofsted website in January 2014. There have been over 5,400 views of the case studies. They were accompanied by a video of Frank McLoughlin in conversation with Matthew Coffey which has been viewed over 800 times. A programme of regional spotlights to disseminate and share the good practice from the case studies was co-ordinated by AoC/AELP, enabling 200 practitioners to engage with the case study material in more depth.
- We are exploring with the LEP network the most effective ways to engage with their members to support a shared agenda to improve the quality and responsiveness of vocational education and training in the localities. In particular, this will involve promoting opportunities for business community involvement in governing bodies and boards of colleges and training providers; encouraging industry experts to 'teach their work' as part of Teach Too; and in response to the FETLAG report, exploring ways to engage technology-focused businesses in working with the sector.
- The Foundation is also developing an overall evaluation of its VET programmes and their contribution to embedding the CAVTL characteristics and features of excellent vocational teaching and learning practice.

CAVTL

Commission on Adult Vocational Teaching and Learning